2015/02/10 seminar@APC

# Breaking of Vainshtein screening in scalar-tensor theories beyond Horndeski

YAMAUCHI, Daisuke Research Center for the Early Universe (RESCEU), U. Tokyo

#### Reference

#### Breaking of Vainshtein screening in scalar-tensor theories beyond Horndeski Tsutomu Kobayashi(Rikkyo), Yuki Watanabe(RESCEU) and DY, arXiv:1411.4130.

# Why modified gravity?

Discovery of cosmic acceleration

: Our understanding of the Universe is incomplete!

Need better understanding of gravity:

-- Dark energy or modified gravity ?

- Small scale : consistent with experiments in the solar-system and on the Earth
- Large scale : can be tested though the cosmological observations



# Modified gravity theories

➤General relativity : massless spin-2

Modified gravity : A new d.o.f. is introduced to achieve the accelerating expansion

*f*(*R*), DGP, Galileon, massive gravity, bi-gravity, ...

- ✓ Scalar-tensor theories
  - Gravity is mediated by  $g_{\mu\nu}$  and  $\varphi$
  - Can capture essential modification of gravity

# Modified gravity theories

Scalars mediates fifth forces strongly constrained by precision tests of gravity at Solar system scale:

#### E.g. $|\Psi/\Phi - 1| < O(10^{-4})$



• Need screening mechanism on short scales

Cosmological test of gravity theories

#### VAINSHTEIN SCREENING MECHANISM

$$ds^{2} = -(1 + 2\Phi(\boldsymbol{x})) dt^{2} + (1 - 2\Psi(\boldsymbol{x})) d\boldsymbol{x}^{2}$$

✓ General Relativity

 $\nabla \Phi = \nabla \Psi = G_{\rm N} M/r^2$ 

0 0

 $ds^{2} = -(1+2\Phi(\boldsymbol{x})) dt^{2} + (1-2\Psi(\boldsymbol{x})) d\boldsymbol{x}^{2}$ 

Any modified model involving scalar dof should accommodate a mechanism to suppress the scalar interaction on small scales



# An example : cubic Galileon

$$\mathcal{L} = -\frac{1}{2} \left(\partial \pi\right)^2 + \frac{1}{4\Lambda^3} \left(\partial \pi\right)^2 \Box \pi - \frac{1}{M_{\rm Pl}} \pi \rho$$

 $\checkmark$  Look for spherical symmetric solution :  $\rho = \rho(r)$ ,  $\pi = \pi(r)$ Algebraic equation for  $\pi'/\Lambda^3 r$   $\frac{1}{\Lambda_3} \frac{\pi'}{r} + \left(\frac{1}{\Lambda^3} \frac{\pi'}{r}\right)^2 = \frac{1}{M_{\rm Pl}\Lambda^3} \frac{M(r)}{4\pi r^3} \equiv A(r)$  $\int \left\{ \begin{array}{l} M_{\rm Pl} \Phi' = -\pi' + \frac{M(r)}{8\pi M_{\rm Pl} r^2} \\ M_{\rm Pl} \Psi' = +\pi' + \frac{M(r)}{8\pi M_{\rm Pl} r^2} \end{array} \right\}$ 







### Lesson from this example

➤ Naively, scalar-tensor theories predict

$$\nabla \pi \sim \nabla \Phi \cong \nabla \Psi$$

Nonlinear derivative interaction of π can be large, leading to self-screening in the vicinity of source (even if Φ<<1)</p>

#### $(\nabla^2 \pi)^n \nabla \pi^{\sim} \nabla \pi << \nabla \Phi = \nabla \Psi$

 2 derivatives acting on π plays central role for implementing Vainshtein mech.

### EFFECTIVE THEORY FOR VAINSHTEIN MECHANISM

#### [Horndeski (1974),Deffayet+Gao+Steer+Zahariade (2011), Kobayashi+Yamaguchi+Yokoyama (2011)]

# Horndeski theory

: The most general scalar-tensor theory with second-order field equations.

$$\mathcal{L} = G_2(\phi, X) - G_3(\phi, X) \Box \phi$$
  
+  $G_4(\phi, X)R + \frac{\partial G_4}{\partial X}(\phi, X) \left[ (\Box \phi)^2 - (\nabla_\mu \nabla_\nu \phi)^2 \right]$   
+  $G_5(\phi, X) G_{\mu\nu} \nabla^\mu \nabla^\nu \phi$   
 $- \frac{1}{6} \frac{\partial G_5}{\partial X}(\phi, X) \left[ (\Box \phi)^3 - 3 \Box \phi (\nabla_\mu \nabla_\nu \phi)^2 + 2 (\nabla_\mu \nabla_\nu \phi)^3 \right]$ 

✓ have **4** arbitrary functions of  $\phi$  and X=-1/2( $\nabla \phi$ )<sup>2</sup>.

✓ is quite useful for a comprehensive study of modified gravity.

# Effective theory for screening mech.

[Cosmological background :

Kimura+Kobayashi+Yamamoto(2012), Kobayashi+Watanabe+**DY** (2014)] [Minkowski background :

Narikawa+Kobayashi+**DY**+Saito (2013), Koyama+Niz+Tasinato(2013)]

# The general theory exhibiting Vainshtein screening mechanism can be derived from Horndeski Lagrangian.

Step 1 : Expand the Lagrangian around FLRW background

$$ds^{2} = -\left(1 + 2\epsilon \frac{\Phi(t, \boldsymbol{x})}{M_{\text{Pl}}}\right) dt^{2} + a^{2}(t) \left(1 - 2\epsilon \frac{\Psi(t, \boldsymbol{x})}{M_{\text{Pl}}}\right) d\boldsymbol{x}^{2}$$
$$\phi = \phi_{0}(t) + \epsilon \pi(t, \boldsymbol{x})$$

# Effective theory for screening mech.

[Cosmological background :

Kimura+Kobayashi+Yamamoto(2012), Kobayashi+Watanabe+**DY** (2014)] [Minkowski background :

Narikawa+Kobayashi+**DY**+Saito (2013), Koyama+Niz+Tasinato(2013)]

#### Step 2 : Quasi-static approximation

$$(\nabla \epsilon)^2 \gg (\partial_t \epsilon)^2 \sim \max[H^2 \epsilon^2, M^2 \epsilon^2]$$

Step 3 : Assume scaling of coefficients

$$G_{3X} = \mathcal{O}\left(\Lambda^{-3}\right) \quad G_{4XX} = \mathcal{O}\left(\Lambda^{-6}\right) \quad \text{etc...}$$

Note : A concrete realization of the above scaling can be found in massive gravity.

# Effective theory for screening mech.

[Cosmological background :

Kimura+Kobayashi+Yamamoto(2012), Kobayashi+Watanabe+**DY** (2014)] [Minkowski background :

Narikawa+Kobayashi+**DY**+Saito (2013), Koyama+Niz+Tasinato(2013)]

Step 4 : Keep (2+*n*)-th order terms with (2+2*n*) spatial derivatives

$$\left(\nabla^2 \epsilon\right)^n \left(\nabla \epsilon\right)^2 \quad \checkmark \quad \nabla^{2n+2} \epsilon^{2+n}$$

- These can be larger than the quadratic terms below a certain scale.
- Such nonlinear derivative interactions are crucial for realizing the Vainshtein mechanism.

### Effective theory from Horndeski

[Kimura+Kobayashi+Yamamoto(2012), Kobayashi+Watanabe+DY (2014)]

$$\mathcal{L}_{\text{Horndeski}}^{\text{eff}} = -a\mathcal{F}\Psi\nabla^{2}\Psi + 2a\mathcal{G}\Psi\nabla^{2}\Phi + \frac{a\eta}{2}\pi\nabla^{2}\pi - a\xi_{1}\Phi\nabla^{2}\pi + 4a\xi_{2}\Psi\nabla^{2}\pi - \frac{a^{3}\rho}{M_{\text{Pl}}}\Phi\delta + \frac{\mu}{a\Lambda^{3}}\mathcal{L}_{3}^{\text{Gal}} + \frac{\nu}{a^{3}\Lambda^{6}}\mathcal{L}_{4}^{\text{Gal}} - \frac{\alpha_{1}}{a\Lambda^{3}}\Phi\mathcal{E}_{3}^{\text{Gal}} + \frac{\alpha_{2}}{a\Lambda^{3}}\Psi\mathcal{E}_{3}^{\text{Gal}} - \frac{\beta}{a^{3}\Lambda^{6}}\Phi\mathcal{E}_{4}^{\text{Gal}} + \frac{\gamma}{a\Lambda^{3}}\nabla^{i}\Phi\nabla^{j}\Psi\left(\delta_{ij}\nabla^{2}\pi - \nabla_{i}\nabla_{j}\pi\right)$$

# Effective theory from Horndeski

[Kimura+Kobayashi+Yamamoto(2012), Kobayashi+Watanabe+DY (2014)]



 $O((\nabla^2 \varepsilon)^n (\nabla \varepsilon)^2) \text{ terms}$  $\mathcal{L}_3^{\text{Gal}} = -\frac{1}{2} (\nabla \pi)^2 (\nabla^2 \pi)$  $\mathcal{L}_4^{\text{Gal}} = -\frac{1}{2} \left( \nabla \pi \right)^2 \left\{ \left( \nabla^2 \pi \right)^2 - \left( \nabla_i \nabla_j \pi \right)^2 \right\}$  $\mathcal{L}_{\mathrm{Horr}}^{\mathrm{eff}}$  $\mathcal{E}_{3}^{\text{Gal}} = \left(\nabla^{2}\pi\right)^{2} - \left(\nabla_{i}\nabla_{j}\pi\right)^{2}$  $\mathcal{E}_4^{\text{Gal}} = \left(\nabla^2 \pi\right)^3 - 3 \left(\nabla^2 \pi\right) \left(\nabla_i \nabla_j \pi\right)^2 + 2 \left(\nabla_i \nabla_j \pi\right)^3$  $+ rac{\mu}{a\Lambda^3} \mathcal{L}_3^{\text{Gal}} + rac{
u}{a^3\Lambda 6} \mathcal{L}_4^{\text{Gal}}$  $-\frac{\alpha_1}{a\Lambda^3}\Phi\mathcal{E}_3^{\text{Gal}} + \frac{\alpha_2}{a\Lambda^3}\Psi\mathcal{E}_3^{\text{Gal}} - \frac{\beta}{a^3\Lambda^6}\Phi\mathcal{E}_4^{\text{Gal}}$  $+ \frac{\gamma}{a\Lambda^3} \nabla^i \Phi \nabla^j \Psi \left( \delta_{ij} \nabla^2 \pi - \nabla_i \nabla_j \pi \right)$ 

# Effective theory from Horndeski

✓ Hereafter we focus on the subclass of  $\beta = \gamma = 0$ , which amounts for switching off  $G_5$ 

- $\beta \neq 0 \rightarrow$  Vainshtein solutions are unstable [Koyama+(2013)]
- γ≠0 → Metric potentials do not show the correct Newtonian behavior [Kobayashi+(2013)]



#### Spherical overdensity from Horndeski

In terms of 
$$x = \frac{1}{\Lambda^3} \frac{\pi'}{a^2 r}$$
  $A = \frac{1}{M_{\rm Pl}\Lambda^3} \frac{M(t,r)}{8\pi r^3}$ 

Algebraic equation for *x* can be written as



Solving algebraic equation for x is essential for constructing Vainshtein solution.

 $\mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{A} + 2\left[\mathcal{O}(1) + \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{A}\right]\mathbf{x} + \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{x}^2 - \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{x}^3 = 0$ 



 $\mathcal{O}(1)A + 2\left[\mathcal{O}(1) + \mathcal{O}(1)A\right]x + \mathcal{O}(1)x^2 - \mathcal{O}(1)x^3 = 0$ 

#### Sı

1

Outer region  $\rightarrow$  linear regime & A<<1

• There is always a decaying solution :  $x \sim O(A) <<1 \rightarrow \Phi' \simeq \Psi' \sim O(A)$ 

 $\mathcal{O}(1)A + 2\left[\mathcal{O}(1) + \mathcal{O}(1)A\right]x + \mathcal{O}(1)x^2 - \mathcal{O}(1)x^3 = 0$ /ainshte 20

Inner region  $\rightarrow$  nonlinear regime & A >> 1

- Imposing the condition that two of three terms balance:
  - $\checkmark x \sim O(A^{1/2})$  case
    - $\rightarrow \Phi'/a^2 M_{\rm Pl} = \Psi'/a^2 M_{\rm Pl} = G_{\rm N}(t) M/r^2$

GR can be reproduced inside the Vainshtein radius (2)

✓ (other cases  $\rightarrow \Phi' \neq \Psi'$  even in  $r < r_v$ )

## EFFECTIVE THEORY FROM BEYOND-HORNDESKI

# Horndeski theory

can be generalized w/o introducing any propagating dof : *beyond-Horndeski theory*.

[Gleyzes+Langlois+Piazza+Vernizzi (2014)]

Inevitably has higher-order field equations.
 Introduces a preferred time-slicing on which # of initial conditions remain the same.

 $\blacktriangleright$  Lagrangian in a covariant form by reviving  $\phi$ :

$$\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{L}_{\mathrm{Horndeski}} + \mathcal{L}_{\mathrm{beyond}}$$

### Horndeski theory

can be generalized w/o introducing any

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{L}_{\text{beyond}} = & F_4(\phi, X) \bigg\{ \nabla^{\mu} \phi \nabla^{\nu} \phi \nabla_{\mu} \nabla_{\nu} \phi \Box \phi - \nabla^{\mu} \nabla_{\mu} \nabla_{\lambda} \phi \nabla^{\nu} \nabla_{\nu} \nabla^{\lambda} \phi + X \Big[ (\Box \phi)^2 - (\nabla_{\mu} \nabla_{\nu} \phi)^2 \Big] \bigg\} \\ &+ F_5(\phi, X) \bigg\{ (\Box \phi)^2 \nabla^{\mu} \phi \nabla^{\nu} \phi \nabla_{\mu} \nabla_{\nu} \phi - 2 \Box \phi \nabla^{\mu} \phi \nabla_{\mu} \nabla_{\lambda} \phi \nabla^{\nu} \phi \nabla_{\nu} \nabla^{\lambda} \phi \\ &- (\nabla_{\mu} \nabla_{\nu} \phi)^2 \nabla^{\rho} \phi \nabla^{\lambda} \phi \nabla_{\rho} \nabla_{\sigma} \phi + 2 \nabla^{\mu} \phi \nabla_{\mu} \nabla^{\lambda} \phi \nabla_{\lambda} \nabla^{\rho} \phi \nabla_{\rho} \nabla_{\lambda} \phi \nabla^{\lambda} \phi \\ &+ \frac{2}{3} X \Big[ (\Box \phi)^3 - 3 \Box \phi (\nabla_{\mu} \nabla_{\nu} \phi)^2 + 2 (\nabla_{\mu} \nabla_{\nu} \phi)^3 \Big] \bigg\} \end{split}$$

✓ have **6** arbitrary functions of  $\phi$  and X=-1/2( $\nabla \phi$ )<sup>2</sup>.

Lagrangian in a covariant ionin by re

$$\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{L}_{\text{Horndeski}} + \mathcal{L}_{\text{beyond}}$$

# New terms from beyond-Horndeski

$$\mathcal{L}^{\mathrm{eff}} = \mathcal{L}_{\mathrm{Horndeski}}^{\mathrm{eff}} + \mathcal{L}_{\mathrm{beyond}}^{\mathrm{eff}}$$

≻New terms



- ✓ Other terms generated by the beyond-Horndeski term can be absorbed in the redefinition of the corresponding coefficients.
- ✓ Taking limit  $g_{\mu\nu}$ → $\eta_{\mu\nu}$ , X→0, only the Honrdeski term survive and there is no new term.

# New terms from beyond-Horndeski

- ✓ Other terms generated by the beyond-Horndeski term can be absorbed in the redefinition of the corresponding coefficients.
- ✓ Taking limit  $g_{\mu\nu}$ → $\eta_{\mu\nu}$ , X→0, only the Honrdeski term survive and there is no new term.

# New terms from beyond-Horndeski

$$\mathcal{L}^{\mathrm{eff}} = \mathcal{L}^{\mathrm{eff}}_{\mathrm{Horndeski}} + \mathcal{L}^{\mathrm{eff}}_{\mathrm{beyond}}$$

► New terms



### Impact of $\nabla^3 \epsilon$ : spherical overdensity

In terms of 
$$x = \frac{1}{\Lambda^3} \frac{\pi'}{a^2 r}$$
  $A = \frac{1}{M_{\rm Pl}\Lambda^3} \frac{M(t,r)}{8\pi r^3}$ 

Algebraic equation for *x* can be written as

$$\mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{A} + 2\left[\mathcal{O}(1) + \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{A} + \mathcal{O}(1)\alpha_*r\mathbf{A'}\right]\mathbf{x} + \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{x}^2 - \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{x}^3 = 0$$

Inner solution is determined not only the enclosed mass  $(M \propto A)$  but also from the local energy density  $(A' \sim \rho)!$ 

 $\mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{A} + 2\left[\mathcal{O}(1) + \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{A} + \mathcal{O}(1)\alpha_* r\mathbf{A}'\right]\mathbf{x} + \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{x}^2 - \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{x}^3 = 0$ 



 $\mathcal{O}(1)A + 2\left[\mathcal{O}(1) + \mathcal{O}(1)A + \mathcal{O}(1)a_*rA'\right]x + \mathcal{O}(1)x^2 - \mathcal{O}(1)x^3 = 0$ 



 $\mathcal{O}(1)A + 2\left[\mathcal{O}(1) + \mathcal{O}(1)A + \mathcal{O}(1)\alpha_* rA'\right]x + \mathcal{O}(1)x^2 - \mathcal{O}(1)x^3 = 0$ 

Inner region  $\rightarrow$  nonlinear regime & A, A', A''>>1

$$x^2 = \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{A} + \mathcal{O}(1)\alpha_* r\mathbf{A'}$$

Plugging the concrete expression of the coefficients,

**New contribution** 

 $\mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{A} + 2\left[\mathcal{O}(1) + \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{A} + \mathcal{O}(1)\alpha_* r\mathbf{A}'\right]\mathbf{x} + \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{x}^2 - \mathcal{O}(1)\mathbf{x}^3 = 0$ 



 $\mathcal{O}(1)A + 2\left[\mathcal{O}(1) + \mathcal{O}(1)A + \mathcal{O}(1)\alpha_* rA'\right]x + \mathcal{O}(1)x^2 - \mathcal{O}(1)x^3 = 0$ 

Vainshteir radius

Inside the overdensity region  $M', M'' \neq 0 \Leftrightarrow \Phi' \neq \Psi'$ Screening mech. fails to operate!

Э

Surfa



# Impact of $\nabla^2 \partial_t \epsilon$ : linear growth

Cosmological Poisson equation

$$\alpha = \left(1 + \mathcal{O}(1)\,\xi_t^2 \frac{\rho}{M_{\rm Pl}\Lambda^3}\right)^{1/2} a$$

$$\frac{\nabla^2 \Phi}{a^2 M_{\rm Pl}} = 4\pi G_{\rm eff} \rho \delta - 2\left(\frac{\dot{\alpha}}{\alpha} - H\right)\dot{\delta}$$

- Time-dependent effective gravitational coupling Additional friction from scalar field
- Evolution of density contrast

$$\ddot{\delta} + 2\frac{\dot{\alpha}}{\alpha}\dot{\delta} = 4\pi G_{\mathrm{eff}}\rho \delta$$
 + Energy-momentum conservation eq.

Beyond-term modifies the expansion rate felt by the density perturbations as well as  $G_{eff}$ 

# Summary

Effective Lagrangian on small scales is studied in the context of scalar-tensor theories beyond Horndeski

> New terms generates 3<sup>rd</sup> spatial derivatives in field eqs

✓ Vainshtein screening mechanism operates outside the source and inside Vainshtein radius
 ✓ Φ ≠ Ψ inside the source even in r<r<sub>V</sub>

Linear growth of density perturbations is modified

 $\checkmark$  G<sub>eff</sub> and additional friction

#### Future

- Observational consequence of breaking of Vainshtein screening
  - Motion of a galaxy inside a cluster?
  - Modified structure of stars?

# Thank you!

$$\begin{split} \widetilde{M}_{P1}^{2}\mathcal{F} &\to \widetilde{M}_{P1}^{2}\mathcal{F}, & (A13) \\ \widetilde{M}_{P1}^{2}\mathcal{G} &\to \widetilde{M}_{P1}^{2}\mathcal{G}, & (A14) \\ \widetilde{M}_{P1}\eta \to \widetilde{M}_{P1}\eta + 4\left(10H^{2}X + 5\dot{H}X + 6H\dot{X}\right)F_{4} + 4X\left(5H^{2}X + 2\dot{H}X + 9H\dot{X}\right)F_{4X} + 8HX^{2}\dot{X}F_{4XX} \\ &\quad + 12HX\dot{\phi}F_{4\phi} + 8HX^{2}\dot{\phi}F_{4\phi X} - 8HX\left(5H^{2}\dot{\phi} + 6\dot{H}\dot{\phi} + 10H\ddot{\phi}\right)F_{5} - 8HX^{2}\left(2H^{2}\dot{\phi} + 2\dot{H}\dot{\phi} + 11H\ddot{\phi}\right)F_{5X} \\ &\quad - 16H^{2}X^{3}\ddot{\phi}F_{5XX} - 32H^{2}X^{2}F_{5\phi} - 16H^{2}X^{3}F_{5\phi X}, & (A15) \\ \widetilde{M}_{P1}\xi_{1} \to \widetilde{M}_{P1}\xi_{1} - 2HX\dot{\phi}\left(5F_{4} + 2XF_{4X}\right) + 4H^{2}X^{2}\left(7F_{5} + 2XF_{5X}\right), & (A16) \\ \widetilde{M}_{P1}\xi_{2} \to \widetilde{M}_{P1}\xi_{2}, & (A17) \\ \widetilde{M}_{P1}\dot{\alpha}_{3} \to \frac{\widetilde{M}_{P1}\alpha_{3}}{\Lambda^{3}} + X\left(5F_{4} + 2XF_{4X}\right) - 2HX\dot{\phi}\left(7F_{5} + 2XF_{5X}\right), & (A18) \\ \widetilde{M}_{P1}\alpha_{2} \to \widetilde{M}_{P1}\dot{\alpha}_{3} + XF_{4} - 2HX\dot{\phi}F_{5}, & (A19) \\ \frac{\widetilde{M}_{P1}\alpha_{2}}{\Lambda^{3}} \to \frac{\widetilde{M}_{P1}\alpha_{3}}{\Lambda^{3}} + XF_{4} - 2HX\dot{\phi}F_{5}, & (A19) \\ \frac{\widetilde{M}_{P1}\beta}{\Lambda^{6}} \to \frac{\widetilde{M}_{P1}\beta}{\Lambda^{3}} + \frac{2X}{3}\left(7F_{5} + 2XF_{5X}\right), & (A20) \\ \frac{\mu}{\Lambda^{3}} \to \frac{\mu}{\Lambda^{3}} - 2\left(\ddot{\phi} + 5H\dot{\phi}\right)F_{4} - 5X\left(\ddot{\phi} + H\dot{\phi}\right)F_{4X} - 2X^{2}\ddot{\phi}F_{4XX} + XF_{4\phi} - 2X^{2}F_{4\phi X} \\ &\quad + 2\left(5H^{2}X + 2H\dot{X} + 14\dot{H}X\right)F_{5} + 2\left(2H^{2}X + 2\dot{H}X + 11H\dot{X}\right)XF_{5X} \\ &\quad + 4HX^{2}\dot{X}F_{5XX} + 8H\dot{X}\dot{\phi}F_{5\phi} + 4HX^{2}F_{5\phi X}, & (A21) \\ \frac{\nu}{\Lambda^{3}} \to \frac{\nu}{\Lambda^{3}} + 2F_{4} + XF_{4X} - \frac{20}{3}\ddot{\phi}F_{5} - \frac{22}{3}\ddot{X}\ddot{\phi}F_{5X} - \frac{4}{3}X^{2}\ddot{\phi}F_{5XX} - \frac{8}{3}XF_{5\phi} - \frac{4}{3}X^{2}F_{5\phi X}, & (A23) \\ \frac{\widetilde{M}_{P1}^{2}\gamma}{\Lambda^{3}} \to \frac{\widetilde{M}_{P1}^{2}\gamma}{\Lambda^{3}}. & (A23) \end{array}$$